Title IX Compliance & Athletics
Higher Education Training Course
Any advice or opinion provided during this training, either privately or to the entire group, is **never** to be construed as legal advice. Always consult with your legal counsel to ensure you are receiving advice that considers existing case law, any applicable state or local laws, and evolving federal guidance.
CONTENT ADVISORY

The content and discussion in this course will necessarily engage with sex- and gender-based harassment, discrimination, and violence and associated sensitive topics that can evoke strong emotional responses.

ATIXA faculty members may offer examples that emulate the language and vocabulary Title IX practitioners encounter in their roles including slang, profanity, and other graphic or offensive language.
AGENDA

1. Overview and History of Title IX and Athletics
2. Accommodation of Interests and Abilities
3. Athletic Financial Assistance
4. Other Athletic Benefits and Opportunities
5. Red Flags
6. Sexual Harassment in Sports
7. Inter- and Intra-squad Dating
No person in the United States shall, on the basis of sex, be excluded from participation in, be denied the benefits of, or be subjected to discrimination under any education program or activity receiving Federal financial assistance....

—JUNE 23, 1972
TITLE IX

Title IX

Discrimination

- Sex/Gender Discrimination
- Program Equity
- Quid pro Quo
- Hostile Environment
- Retaliation

Harassment
ATHLETICS is not mentioned in the 1972 Title IX statute

Proposed regulations (1974) did and created a fire-storm

Regulations passed in 1975 and athletics was given three years to comply

Dec. 11, 1979, HEW issued the “Intercollegiate Athletics Policy Interpretation”

- Contained the “Three-Part Test” to determine Title IX compliance with student interests and abilities
Civil Rights Restoration Act restored Title IX’s application to athletics

1984

Grove City College v. Bell exempted most athletic programs from Title IX

1988

The OCR studied the efficacy of the Three-Part Test and institutions’ compliance with it

1990s

“Clarification on Intercollegiate Athletics Policy Guidance: The Three-Part Test”

1996

The OCR again examined the Three-Part Test and restated that it remained unchanged

2003

“Additional Clarification” from the OCR that weakened the Three-Part Test

2005

The OCR rescinded its 2005 guidance

2010
RECENT REGULATIONS & REQUIREMENTS

2020 Title IX Regulations

- Effect on athletics interim actions
- Effect on investigations and jurisdiction

NCAA Campus Sexual Violence Policy – Annual Attestation

- Policy training and compliance
- Dissemination of information
- Annual education for all student-athletes, coaches, and staff
- Prior conduct disclosure form for all prospective, continuing, and transfer student-athletes
- Prior conduct check
- Policy regarding gathering information from previous institution(s)

Source: NCAA Sexual Violence Policy (April 2021)
NAME, IMAGE, AND LIKENESS

- Individuals can engage in name, image, and likeness (NIL) activities that are consistent with the law of the state where the school is located. Colleges and universities may be a resource for state law questions.

- College athletes who attend a school in a state without an NIL law can engage in this type of activity without violating NCAA rules related to name, image, and likeness.

- Individuals can use a professional services provider for NIL activities.

- Student-athletes should report NIL activities consistent with state law or school and conference requirements to their school.

Source: NCAA Interim Name, Image, and Likeness Policy (2021)
Three-Part Test and the 13 program components are typically not as problematic for Intramurals and Club Sports because those programs are typically self-initiated and fewer benefits are provided by the institution.
The journey starts by asking those affected how they see and are impacted by the conditions, rules, and resources.

EQUALITY requires a level playing field that doesn’t yet exist

EQUITY acknowledges systemic impediments with targeted fixes

JUSTICE eliminates systemic barriers

AGENCY individuals know that access is their right

Title IX requires an institution to:

- Provide equal opportunities for female and male students to become intercollegiate athletes
  - Analyzed by means of a three-part test ("prongs")

- Provide equitable treatment of participants in the overall women’s program as compared to the overall men’s program
  - Analyzed according to thirteen (13) different program components (The “Laundry List”)

Title IX does not require an institution to:

- Provide the same funding to the overall women’s and men’s programs
- Provide the same funding to men’s and women’s teams for the same sport
- Provide specific benefits to teams
- Offer the same number of teams for men and women
- Offer the same sports for men and women
- Provide the same benefits to men’s and women’s teams in the same sport
- Compete at a specific level

ATHLETIC OVERSIGHT – GENDER EQUITY

- The oversight of compliance remains the responsibility of the *Institution’s* Title IX Coordinator (TIXC)
- **Compliance in athletics** may be delegated to the Senior Woman Administrator (SWA = NCAA distinction) or compliance officer in athletics
  - Need for outside education on the various areas of TIX
- Institutions should have a Deputy TIXC in athletics
  - Athletics Deputy TIXC should **not** be the Recipient’s TIXC
THE THREE-PART TEST: ACCOMMODATION OF INTERESTS AND ABILITIES

- Proportionality
- Program Expansion
- Full Accommodation
THREE-PART TEST (1979)

1. Opportunities for males and females substantially proportionate to their respective enrollments; OR

2. Where one sex has been underrepresented, a history and continuing practice of program expansion responsive to the developing interests and abilities of that sex; OR

3. Where one sex is underrepresented and cannot show a continuing practice of program expansion, whether it can be demonstrated that the interests and abilities of that sex have been fully and effectively accommodated by that present program

Effective accommodation of interests and abilities
COUNTING PARTICIPANTS

- For purposes of Title IX compliance, a participant is defined as those athletes who:
  - Regularly receive institutionally sponsored support normally provided to athletes
  - Regularly participate in organized practices or team meetings and activities during the season
  - Are listed on the eligibility or squad list
  - Are injured, but continue to receive financial aid on the basis of athletic ability

Participants also include those who:

- Are listed on a team’s squad or eligibility list AND are on the team as of the team's first competitive event
- Join the team during the season*
- Are a walk-on
- Are a member of the JV, freshman, “B” team, etc.
- Quit or were cut after the first competitive event
- Are a Redshirt athlete
- Are a mid-year transfer eligible to participate in the spring

*Season begins on the date of a team’s first intercollegiate competitive event and concludes on the date of the final intercollegiate competitive event.

COUNTING PARTICIPANTS (CONT.)

- The following are **not** participants:
  - Unfilled team slots or positions
  - Club, intramural and recreation program participants
  - Cheerleaders*
  - Athletes who quit or are cut BEFORE first competitive event of the season
  - Sport participants out of season (e.g., spring football)
  - Scrimmage or practice squads
  - Student managers,* student coaches,* student trainers*
  - Students who are academically ineligible
  - Mid-year transfers if no spring season

*Even if they receive scholarships

PART 1: PROPORTIONALITY

Opportunities for males and females substantially proportionate to their respective enrollments

- Substantially proportionate accounts for natural fluctuations in enrollment and participation rates, but institutions must adjust if shifted enrollment or participation shifts persist.

- The OCR uses a case-by-case analysis, rather than a rigid statistical requirement (e.g., within 1% of student body).

- The OCR would also consider opportunities to be substantially proportionate when the number of opportunities that would be required to achieve proportionality would not be sufficient to sustain a viable team.

PART 2: PROGRAM EXPANSION

In analyzing a history of program expansion, the OCR considers:

- An institution’s record of adding intercollegiate teams, or upgrading teams to intercollegiate status, for the underrepresented sex
- An institution’s record of increasing the numbers of participants in intercollegiate athletics who are members of the underrepresented sex

PART 2: PROGRAM EXPANSION (CONT.)

- An institution’s affirmative responses to requests by students or others for addition or elevation of sports
- An institution’s current implementation of a nondiscriminatory policy or procedure for requesting the addition of sports (including the elevation of club or intramural teams) and the effective communication of the policy or procedure to students
- An institution’s current implementation of a plan of program expansion that is responsive to developing interests and abilities

PART 3: FULL ACCOMMODATION

Whether it can be demonstrated that the interests and abilities of that sex have been fully and effectively accommodated by that present program

The OCR will consider whether:

▪ There is sufficient unmet interest to support an intercollegiate team
▪ There is sufficient ability to sustain an intercollegiate team
▪ There is a reasonable expectation of competition for the team

LEVELS OF COMPETITION

- Equivalently Advanced Competitive Opportunities
- Upgrades of Competitive Opportunities
LEVELS OF COMPETITION

The OCR assesses compliance by examining:

▪ Whether the competitive schedules for men's and women's teams, on a program-wide basis, afford proportionally similar numbers of male and female athletes equivalently advanced competitive opportunities

OR

▪ Whether the institution can demonstrate a history and continuing practice of upgrading the competitive opportunities available to the historically disadvantaged sex as warranted by developing abilities among the athletes of that sex

ATHLETIC FINANCIAL ASSISTANCE

- Financial Assistance
- Counting Participants for Financial Assistance
FINANCIAL ASSISTANCE

- Must provide **reasonable opportunities** for financial assistance to members of each sex in proportion to the participation rate of each sex in intercollegiate athletics
  - Does **NOT** require same number of scholarships for men and women or scholarship of equal value
- Total amount awarded must be “substantially proportionate to the participation rates” of men and women in the institution’s athletic programs
- Disparities could be non-discriminatory in origin
  - E.g., in-state vs. out-of-state recruits; reasonable professional decisions
- Also applies to work-related aid programs or loans

MULTI-SPORT ATHLETES AND FINANCIAL ASSISTANCE

- There is a different standard for counting multi-sport athletes for scholarship participants than for all other forms of Title IX analyses.

- Scholarship counting
  - An athlete who participates in multiple sports is counted as only ONE scholarship.
  - Based on total program participation, not individual team analysis.
  - Typically, does not matter for which team the student is counted.
  - All other forms of Title IX analysis.
  - An athlete who participates in multiple sports is counted as a participant for each sport.

OTHER ATHLETIC BENEFITS AND OPPORTUNITIES

- Equipment and Supplies
- Scheduling (Games and Practice Times)
- Travel and Per Diem Allowance
- Coaches
- Tutors
- Locker Rooms and Other Facilities
- Medical and Training Services
- Housing and Dining Services
- Publicity
- Recruitment of Student Athletes
- Provision of Support Services
ATHLETIC OVERSIGHT – GENDER EQUITY

Equivalent Treatment of Student Athletes

- Scholarships
- Equipment & Supplies
- Scheduling
- Tutoring
- Locker Rooms & Facilities
- Medical & Training Services
- Housing & Dining
- Support Services
- Coaching
- Travel & Per Diem
- Publicity

© 2022 Association of Title IX Administrators
EQUIPMENT & SUPPLIES

Key factors in examining the equivalence for men and women:

▪ Quality of equipment and suppliers
▪ Amount of equipment and supplies
▪ Suitability of equipment and supplies
▪ Maintenance and replacement of the equipment and supplies
▪ Availability of equipment and supplies

SCHEDULING OF GAMES AND PRACTICE TIMES

Key factors in examining the equivalence for men and women:

- Number of competitive events per sport
- Number and length of practice opportunities
- Time of day competitive events are scheduled
- Time of day practice opportunities are scheduled
- Opportunities to engage in available pre-season and post-season competition

Key factors in examining the equivalence for men and women:

- Modes of transportation
- Housing furnished during travel
- Length of stay before and after competitive events
- Per diem allowances
- Dining arrangements

COACHING

Key factors in examining coaching:

- Opportunity to receive coaching
  - Relative availability of full-time coaches
  - Relative availability of part-time and assistant coaches
  - Relative availability of graduate assistants

- Assignment of coaches
  - Training, experience, and other professional qualifications
  - Professional standing

COACHING (CONT.)

Key factors in examining coaching:

▪ Compensation of coaches
  ▪ Rate of compensation (per sport, per season)
  ▪ Duration of contracts
  ▪ Conditions relating to contract renewal
  ▪ Experience
  ▪ Nature of coaching duties performed
  ▪ Working conditions
  ▪ Other terms and conditions of employment

ACADEMIC TUTORING

Key factors in examining the equivalence for men and women:

▪ Academic Tutoring
  ▪ Availability of tutoring
  ▪ Procedures and criteria for obtaining tutorial assistance

▪ Assignment of Tutors
  ▪ Tutor qualifications
  ▪ Training, experience, and other qualifications

▪ Compensation of Tutors
  ▪ Hourly rate of payment by nature subjects tutored
  ▪ Pupil loads per tutoring season
  ▪ Tutor qualifications
  ▪ Experience
  ▪ Other terms and conditions of employment

KEY FACTORS IN EXAMINING THE EQUIVALENCE FOR MEN AND WOMEN:

- Quality and availability of the facilities provided for practice and competitive events
- Exclusivity of use of facilities provided for practice and competitive events
- Availability of locker rooms
- Quality of locker rooms
- Maintenance of practice and competitive facilities
- Preparation of facilities for practice and competitive events

MEDICAL AND TRAINING FACILITIES AND SERVICES

Key factors in examining the equivalence for men and women:

- Availability of medical personnel and assistance
- Health, accident, and injury insurance coverage
- Availability and quality of weight and training facilities
- Availability and quality of conditioning facilities
- Availability and qualifications of athletic trainers

Key factors in examining the equivalence for men and women:

- Housing provided
- Special services as part of housing arrangements (e.g., laundry facilities, parking space, cleaning service)

Key factors in examining the equivalence for men and women:

▪ Availability and quality of sports information personnel
▪ Access to other publicity resources for men's and women's programs
▪ Quantity and quality of publications and other promotional devices featuring men's and women's programs

RECRUITMENT OF STUDENT ATHLETES

Key factors in examining the equivalence for men and women:

- Whether coaches or other professional athletic personnel in the programs serving male and female athletes are provided with substantially equal opportunities to recruit.

- Whether the financial and other resources made available for recruitment in male and female athletic programs are equivalently adequate to meet the needs of each program.

- Whether the differences in benefits, opportunities, and treatment afforded prospective student athletes of each sex have a disproportionately limiting effect upon the recruitment of students of either sex.

The administrative and clerical support provided to an athletic program can affect the overall provision of opportunity to male and female athletes, particularly to the extent that the provided services enable coaches to perform better their coaching functions.

**Key factors:**

- Amount of administrative assistance provided to men's and women's programs
- Amount of secretarial and clerical assistance provided to men's and women's programs

RED FLAGS TO LOOK FOR AND ASK ABOUT

- Proportionality
- Program Expansion
- No Unmet Interest
- Retaliation
- Equal Pay
- Hostile Environment
“We absolutely have enough money to add a new men’s team!”

“But no one has complained about our lack of women’s sports!”

“We just added a women’s team, so we definitely comply with prong two!”

“We will reach proportionality through roster management!”

“It’s OK, we are cutting a men’s and a women’s team!”

“Our proportionality is within 5 percentage points - close enough!”

“We absolutely have enough money to add a new men’s team!”
Gender imbalance on coaching staff

Closed hiring

Salaries not benchmarked

Female/women’s coaches disciplined more often

Complaints about hostile environment

Complaints about gender equity
SEXUAL HARASSMENT, SEXUAL VIOLENCE, AND INTIMATE PARTNER VIOLENCE AND SPORT

- Recent Examples
- Instructive Cases
- Prevalence
- NCAA Position
- Definitions
- Obligations
- Challenges
COLLEGIATE ATHLETICS AND SEXUAL VIOLENCE EXAMPLES

- Florida State University
- University of Montana
- University of Georgia
- University of Colorado
- Vanderbilt University
- Oregon State University
- Xavier University
- University of Missouri
- University of Notre Dame
The Executive Committee expects NCAA members to...**operate fairly and ethically**, and further to assure that student-athletes are neither advantaged nor disadvantaged by special treatment and that institutions’ athletics departments must:

- Comply with campus authorities and ensure that all athletics staff, coaches, administrators and student-athletes maintain a **hostile-free environment for all student-athletes** regardless of gender or sexual orientation
- **know and follow campus protocol** for reporting incidents of sexual violence
- **report immediately any suspected sexual violence to appropriate campus offices for investigation and adjudication**
Educate all student-athletes, coaches, and staff about sexual violence prevention, intervention and response

Assure compliance with all federal and applicable state regulations related to sexual violence prevention and response

Cooperate with but not manage, direct, control, or interfere with college or university investigations into allegations of sexual violence ensuring that investigations involving student-athletes and athletics department staff are managed in the same manner as all other students and staff on campus

Source: NCAA Executive Committee: August 8, 2014
NCAA POLICY IMPLEMENTATION TIMELINE

- NCAA member institutions have access to policy examples (log-in required) and additional resources through the NCAA website: https://ncaa.org/csvpolicy

- **2021-22 Academic Year**
  - Attestation period begins March 1, 2022
  - Attestation period ends May 15, 2022
  - President/chancellor, director of athletics, and campus Title IX coordinator attest their compliance with the policy for the 2021-22 academic year
  - Attesting to items 1 - 3 of the policy
NCAA POLICY IMPLEMENTATION TIMELINE (CONT.)

- **2022-23 Academic Year**
  - Attestation period begins March 1, 2023
  - Attestation period ends May 15, 2023
  - President/chancellor, director of athletics, and campus Title IX coordinator attest their compliance with the policy for the 2022-23 academic year
  - Attesting to items 1-6 of the policy
1. The athletics department is informed on, integrated in, and compliant with institutional policies and processes regarding sexual violence prevention and proper adjudication and resolution of acts of sexual and interpersonal violence.

2. The institutional policies and processes regarding sexual violence prevention and adjudication, and the name and contact information for the campus Title IX Coordinator*, are readily available within the department of athletics, and are provided to student-athletes.

*For international members and schools that do not receive federal funding, or are otherwise exempt from Title IX, the signature should be from the Title IX coordinator or institutional staff member with comparable responsibilities.
3. All student-athletes, coaches and staff have been educated each year on sexual violence prevention, intervention and response, to the extent allowable by state law and collective bargaining agreements.

4. All incoming, continuing and transfer student-athletes have completed an annual disclosure related to their conduct that resulted in discipline through a Title IX proceeding or in a criminal conviction for sexual, interpersonal or other acts of violence.** Transfer student-athletes also must disclose whether a Title IX proceeding was incomplete at the time of transfer. Failure to make a full and accurate disclosure could result in penalties, including loss of eligibility to participate in athletics as determined by the member institution.
**A person who has been disciplined through a Title IX proceeding or criminally convicted, regardless of the degree, and whether the result of a plea or court determination, of either of the following:

**Interpersonal Violence:** Violence that is predominantly caused due to the relationship between the victim and the perpetrator, including dating and domestic violence.

**Sexual Violence:** A term used to include both forcible and nonforcible sex offenses, ranging from sexual battery to rape.

**Other Acts of Violence:** Crimes including murder, manslaughter, aggravated assault or any assault that employs the use of a deadly weapon or causes serious bodily injury.

Source: NCAA Policy to Combat Campus Sexual Violence.
5. Institutions have taken reasonable steps to confirm whether incoming, continuing and transfer student-athletes have been disciplined through a Title IX proceeding or criminally convicted of sexual, interpersonal or other acts of violence.** In a manner consistent with federal and state law, all NCAA member institutions must share relevant discipline information and incomplete Title IX proceedings as a result of transfer with other member institutions when a student-athlete attempts to enroll in a new college or university.

Source: NCAA Policy to Combat Campus Sexual Violence.
POLICY ON CAMPUS SEXUAL VIOLENCE (CONT.)

6. An institution choosing to recruit an incoming student-athlete or accept a transfer student-athlete must have a written procedure that directs its staff to gather information that reasonably yields information from the former institution(s) to put the recruiting institutional leadership on notice that the student left the institution with an incomplete Title IX proceeding, was disciplined through a Title IX proceeding or has a criminal conviction for sexual, interpersonal or other acts of violence.** Failure to have it written and to gather information consistent with that procedure could result in penalties.

Source: NCAA Policy to Combat Campus Sexual Violence.
UNDERSTANDING THE THREE FORMS OF SEXUAL HARASSMENT

Sexual Harassment is

Unwelcome conduct of a sexual nature or that is sex or gender-based

Based on power differentials (quid pro quo)

The creation of a hostile environment

Retaliation
INSTITUTIONAL OBLIGATIONS UNDER TITLE IX

Sexual Harassment

- Investigate
- Stop
- Prevent
- Remedy
# THE IX COMMANDMENTS

## INVESTIGATION
(plus **prompt** & **fair** per VAWA Sec. 304)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Thorough</th>
<th>Reliable</th>
<th>Impartial</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Prompt</td>
<td>Effective</td>
<td>Equitable</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## PROCESS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Prompt</th>
<th>Effective</th>
<th>Equitable</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Act reasonably to stop discrimination</td>
<td>Act reasonably to prevent recurrence</td>
<td>Act equitably to remedy effects</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## REMEDIES
### INSTRUCTIVE CASES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Simpson v. Univ. of Colorado Boulder, 500 F.3d 1170 (10th Cir. 2007).</th>
<th>Williams v. Bd of Regents of Univ. of Georgia, 477 F.3d 1282 (11th Cir. 2007).</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| - Recruiting visits  
- Off-campus parties  
- Climate | - Recruit histories |

| --- | --- |
| - Climate in locker room  
- Player evaluation meetings  
- Power of a coach | - Retaliation |
UNIQUE CHALLENGES: TITLE IX AND STUDENT ATHLETICS

- Athletic department hostile educational environment
- Insularity of teams and the athletic department
- Protectionism of teams and the athletic department
- Coach-Athlete dynamics
  - Power-based
  - Trust-based
  - Recruitment
  - Performance meetings
- Coach-Coach dynamics
UNIQUE CHALLENGES:
TITLE IX AND STUDENT ATHLETICS (CONT.)

- Male privilege
- Body image and focus on the body (especially women)
- Student-athlete on student-athlete violence
- Power dynamics
- Revenue vs. non-revenue sports
- Must-win mentality
UNIQUE CHALLENGES:
TITLE IX AND STUDENT ATHLETICS (CONT.)

- Culture of violence and aggressive behavior in sports
- Male bonding and group loyalty
- Sexualization and subordination of women in male team sports
- Approval of sexist language and attitudes
- Perception of “groupie culture”
- Celebrity sense
- Entitlement
Frame intra-team dating as part of broader relationship management issues that can distract a team from their competitive goals, such as:

- Best friends on a team being cliquey or having a big falling out
- Two teammates dating the same person on another team
- One teammate getting dumped by their partner and then teammate starts dating the ex-partner
- Heterosexual dating on a mixed team
▪ Heterosexual dating on men’s and women’s teams that practice together and travel to competitions together
▪ Same-sex teammates dating on a men’s or on a women’s team
▪ Conflicts between teammates based on race
▪ Conflicts between teammates based on sexual orientation
▪ Conflicts between teammates based on religion
MANAGING DATING RELATIONSHIPS AMONG TEAMMATES (CONT.)

- Develop policy that applies to all relationship management issues rather than focusing on same-sex teammates dating
- Make policies about dating apply to all dating relationships not just same-sex dating
- Range of possible policies on intra-team dating:
  - Prohibit intra-team dating (Not recommended)
  - Ignore intra-team dating (Not recommended)
  - Proactively set expectations for intra-team dating and other dating relationships and interpersonal conflict on the team (Recommended)
CASE STUDIES

Time-permitting
Questions?
LIMITED LICENSE AND COPYRIGHT. By purchasing, and/or receiving, and/or using ATIXA materials, you agree to accept this limited license and become a licensee of proprietary and copyrighted ATIXA-owned materials. The licensee accepts all terms and conditions of this license and agrees to abide by all provisions. No other rights are provided, and all other rights are reserved. These materials are proprietary and are licensed to the licensee only, for its use. This license permits the licensee to use the materials personally and/or internally to the licensee’s organization for training purposes, only. These materials may be used to train Title IX personnel, and thus are subject to 34 CFR Part 106.45(b)(10), requiring all training materials to be posted publicly on a website. No public display, sharing, or publication of these materials by a licensee/purchaser is permitted by ATIXA. You are not authorized to copy or adapt these materials without explicit written permission from ATIXA. No one may remove this license language from any version of ATIXA materials. Licensees will receive a link to their materials from ATIXA. That link, and that link only, may be posted to the licensee’s website for purposes of permitting public access of the materials for review/inspection, only. Should any licensee post or permit someone to post these materials to a public website outside of the authorized materials link, ATIXA will send a letter instructing the licensee to immediately remove the content from the public website upon penalty of copyright violation. These materials may not be used for any commercial purpose except by ATIXA.